

## MACKAY REPLIES TO A. C. LETTER

County Commissioner Argues  
for Uniting the Two Big  
State Schools.

DEFENDS THE COMMISSION

RESENTS ATTACK ON MEN  
NAMED BY GOVERNOR.

County Commissioner John C. Mackay, president of the Alumni association of the University of Utah, has written the following open letter in favor of consolidation of the university and state Agricultural college, in reply to a recent open letter issued by the Alumni association of the Agricultural college:

To The Salt Lake Herald: The answer to the Agricultural college alumni to our recent address claims that the college has 147 college students enrolled and 34 in actual attendance on the day of the official visit at the college. The alumni contends that the commission erred in not allowing that all students in the college above two years of high school work are college and not high school students, and attempt to prove this contention by showing that the college freshman course is somewhat identical, as to the names of the studies pursued, with the freshman course at the university, which requires three years of high school work for entrance.

But the showing is of no consequence, unless the aim is to prove that in the Agricultural college preparatory school the students learn in two years as they do in other similar schools in three years. All school men know that three years beyond the district school is barely sufficient (most universities and colleges require four years) for admission to real college work; and to contend that the Agricultural college students, with only two years of preparation, should be considered college students before they are really such, is to beg the question as to the number of bona fide college students in each school, which was all the commission aimed to show.

### Cost Per Capita.

The college alumni quotes the following from the report of the commission: General fund for the university \$150,500.00 General fund for Agricultural college 101,250.00 In the university 512 students of high school grade at \$46 per capita \$23,640.00 This taken from the general fund, \$150,500, leaves \$127,460 to be divided equally among 464 college students which would be for each student \$274.60 In the Agricultural college: 133 grade students at \$29 per capita \$3,857.00 487 students of high school grade at \$46 per capita \$22,482.00 Total \$26,339.00 This amount taken from the general fund, \$101,250, leaves \$74,911.00 to be divided among 71 college students, which would be for each student \$1,056.35 Mr. Porter proceeds to misstate figures of the commission by an attempt to show that the cost per capita for college students in the Agricultural college is only \$206.95. The answer maintains that:

### Defends Commission's Honesty.

The insinuation that the commission is dishonest and that the college alumni alone is "honest" in its representations,

**MILLIONS  
USE**



**THE WORLD'S  
FAVORITE**

For Preserving, Purifying  
and Beautifying the Skin,  
Scalp, Hair, and Hands.

Colicure Soap combines delicate medicinal and emollient properties derived from Glycerine, the best Skin Cure, with the purest of cleansing ingredients, and the retreating of two million bottles. London, 27, Chancery Lane, E.C. 4, Paris, 1, Rue de la Paix, Boston, 127, Columbus Ave., Boston Drug & Chem. Corp., Sole Proprietors, New York, 100, Broadway, New York, 100, Broadway, New York, 100, Broadway.

is sufficiently refuted by looking at the figures of both parties. For, since the college receives \$101,250 per year for general maintenance, and since it has a total of 623 students, if the 147 students claimed to be of college grade cost only \$206.95 each year, or a total of \$30,421.65, then the remaining students (476) high school students at the Agricultural college, or more than six times the usual cost of district school students and more than three times the usual cost of high school students in other schools. The commission showed that the per capita cost of 71 college students was more than four times as much in the college as in the university. The college alumni tries to amend this by giving figures which show the cost of each one of the 512 high school and district school students to be over six times as great as in other high schools and over six times as great as in district schools. Wherein does this showing improve their case?

### Effect Upon Agriculture.

They quote in full, along with certain references to the alleged unfairness of the commission in abridging this letter in their report, a letter from Professor Brand, which says:

"Idaho, Wyoming, Nevada, and California are conspicuous examples of western consolidated schools. In the institutions of these states you will find very few agricultural students. Idaho has less than a half-dozen, and California comparatively few considering the agricultural wealth and population of the state."

This is quoted as a great and overwhelming argument in favor of separation, but are our friends sure that the above quoted attendance is for students of college grade? So that, had Utah, a "conspicuous example" of western separated schools been added to the list, the Agricultural College of Utah would have proudly stood out with just nine students!

### Effect Upon Attendance.

The college alumni attempt to show that fewer students would attend the schools if united than if kept separate, because: "The students in any college come from a radius of a few miles. The statement is perfect if applied to district schools, is fairly but by no means wholly applicable to high schools, and has least application to real college students, who number in Utah scarcely 500. Undoubtedly if there were three higher state schools instead of two, this number might be increased to say 600. But if, instead of making three or more higher schools, as the argument of Mr. Porter would indicate to be the best course, we should establish a large number of local high schools and limit the students of college grade to one institution, we should multiply the number of students receiving high school training by about the exact number of high schools so established. And since the college, on its own showing, is a high school, then the number of students in the more usual kinds of high schools in many towns instead of maintaining one unusual form of high school in one town only (Logan) the ratios of gain would be measured by the number of high schools brought within the reach of the people. A college in each county would increase but little the number of college students in the state, for one college could do all the higher work; while a high school in each county and in each of the larger cities would increase the number of high school students since we cannot have numerous high schools and also several colleges or universities, the greatest good to the "working men and women" would require the concentration of the higher institutions into one efficient school and the dissemination of the high schools throughout the state.

On Feb. 10, 1905, the commission found but nine students in agriculture in the Agricultural college above three years of high school grade. They found 150 college students present in the School of Mines at the University the day before. Who is willing to say that there would be half as many if the School of Mines existed alone in some other town of the state? Mr. Porter apparently fears that the industry of agriculture would lose its dignity if the study were associated with the study of other industries. Would not the opposite effect be produced? Would not more men study agriculture, and certainly with more pride, if instead of retreating to a small corner of the state they could study it in a greater school side by side with men who are studying other industries? Agriculture is not dignified by isolation. The assumption that the university would operate against the education of working men and women is utterly without a knowledge of the facts. The university exists for the state. Its students, drawn from the homes of the state, are largely of the industrial classes, and receive a practical training for practical, useful and intelligent work.

### Moral Influence.

The fact that Salt Lake City offers many more opportunities for the needy student to earn money, the college alumni do not attempt to controvert. But they retaliate with an attack upon the moral influences of a larger city. Travelers often compare groups of young people similarly trained under the same sort of home influence and church life. In personal life, refinement, self control and freedom from compromising situations, the advantage is invariably in favor of the city groups. There is evil in a city, but the small town, which is a detriment to anybody else may find it seeks it; but the influence under which the student naturally comes in a city is the influence of culture, religion and of truer subjection to law than in a rural town. Educators of keen observation have declared that the morality of students in the larger town is superior to that of students in the smaller town. But the plan proposed is to eliminate high school students from the university and to keep them under their own home influences during their youthful years. If the college alumni sincerely question the ability of students of college grade to conduct themselves properly in a city, they question the propriety of the existence of such universities as Harvard, Yale, Columbia, Pennsylvania, Chicago and others. The supposed increase in the cost of board in a city as compared with a rural town, if it is a fact, is exaggerated in Mr. Porter's letter, and in any event would be cheerfully paid by the college student for the educational advantages of the city.

### Depublication of Courses.

Mr. Porter's letter reveals a matter which was fully considered and settled by law during the last session of the legislature. While the School of Mines did not have a separate name, it was a department of the university till 1901, yet courses in engineering were given in the university as early as 1895. By the enabling act approved July 16, 1894, the university was granted 100,000 acres of land for the establishment and maintenance of a state school of mines, which was established with mining and electrical engineering courses in pursuance of that provision. The courses in civil and mechanical engineering grew out of the courses in mining and electrical engineering because of the absurdity of leaving them out. Dr. Merrill, director of the School of Mines, proved before the legislature that the additional cost to the university of courses in mechanical and civil engineering after it had been equipped to give courses in mining and electrical engineering was not more than \$500 per annum, for the reason that the services of not a single additional professor or instructor would be needed. It was further shown that with the single exception of a three-hour subject in irrigation, all the engineering and other work prescribed by the Agricultural college in its courses in civil and

mechanical engineering was given at the university.

If it be insisted that the engineering courses are older in the college than in the university, then we have this interesting fact: The School of Mines, after only five years (according to Mr. Porter) has 165 college students; whereas the Agricultural college in all its departments, after fifteen years, has only 147 college students, and a third of those would rank as college students in the School of Mines.

### Land for Agriculture.

The college alumni assert that if combination were effected the university would not have enough land for the work of agriculture. The Agricultural college now has 111 acres of partly hilly and gravelly soil in a climate that is not representative of the state; the university has 92 acres, every part but one or two acres level, all fertile, available for any agricultural use whatsoever, and now supporting substantial lawns and groves of many varieties. Mr. Horace Cummings, director of nature study, states that the soil is of the highest fertility, well adapted to all purposes of experiment and investigation.

### Their Plan Examined.

The College alumni say in conclusion: "The assessed valuation of the state is now about \$160,000,000. A one and one-half mill tax on this property would yield \$240,000 annually. This would provide for both institutions. Can we afford it? It means that every taxpayer would pay \$1.50 on every \$1,000 of assessed valuation of his property for the support of the two schools, or if it were divided that the university should have nine-tenths and the Agricultural college six-tenths of a mill, it means that 90 cents of the \$1.50 would go to the support of the university, and 60 cents to the college."

No one and one-half mill tax would not be sufficient, neither should the division be nine-tenths of a mill to the university and six-tenths of a mill to the college. The college asked for \$232,190 at the last legislature; the university for \$235,431 exclusive of the branch normal, which asked for \$40,000. A total of \$667,621 for two years, or \$333,810 per year needed at that time, to say nothing of the growth of these schools in the future, which will far outstrip the growth of wealth and population. The college estimate of Mr. Porter for the great future is exactly the same, less that it asks for by the college for the present two years. The total annual income of the state is \$1,100,000. The income of the university on the same basis would be \$126,000 from this state and about \$146,000 from the land fund, a total of \$272,000. Yet the Agricultural college has one school and the university has three. In Colorado these schools are separated. For the two years preceding January, 1905, the Colorado university received \$230,000; the State School of Mines \$135,000; the State Normal school, \$130,000—a total for the three schools of \$495,000. The funds of the three schools of the University of Colorado have to the fund of the Colorado Agricultural college (\$130,844) about the proportion of four to one. Yet the Utah college alumni propose incomes of \$146,000 to the university and \$126,000 to the college. The university is not one school, but three—the college of arts and sciences, the state school of mines, and the state normal school. Either of these should be as important in this state as the Agricultural college, while the third should be more so.

Mr. Porter maintains that the university while it receives from the state nearly twice the amount received from the state by the college, has only had an average of 32 per cent more students than the college. Both statements are misleading. The second ignores the distinction between the grade of students, considering which the university has six times as many college grade students as the college has. The first ignores the amount received each year by the college from the federal government—\$25,000 for instructional purposes, and over \$5,000 in interest from the land fund. The university receives from the legislature, and it is clear that the college has had far more in proportion to its work than the university, which has asked for the state for as much as it has reasonably needed for higher education, but has done its best with what it has. We have estimated the state could reasonably afford.

### As to Motives and Honesty.

We deplore the attempt of the advocates of separate maintenance to cloud the plain issue by the arts of detraction and slander. They attempt to make it appear that this movement originates in alleged hypocrisy and dishonesty on the part of individuals or in the insatiable lack of honor in the state commission, or in the asserted greed of the people of Salt Lake, or in the supposed hostility of friends; and that if we knew of or suspected any attempt to "assassinate" or even to injure the college, we should resent it quite as emphatically as they themselves do. Nor do we believe that the proper training of college students is consistent with arousing in their minds the worst passions of jealousy and rivalry to which young people are susceptible. We regard the question as the greatest yet placed before the people of Utah, since the results of the decision they make will be far reaching, and will increase with the years. We therefore welcome all information, from whatever source it comes, that will enable the people justly and well to decide a question of such moment.

JOHN C. MACKAY,  
President Alumni Association of the University of Utah,  
Granger, Utah, Sept. 1, 1906.

### THE BREATH OF LIFE.

It's a significant fact that the strongest animal of its size, the gorilla, also has the largest lungs. Powerful lungs means powerful creatures. How to keep the breathing organs right should be man's chiefest study. Like thousands of others, Mrs. O. A. Stephens of Port Williams, O., has learned how to do this. She writes: "Three bottles of Dr. King's New Discovery stopped my cough of two years and cured me of what my friends thought consumption. O. M. I. Drug Dept. Price 50c and \$1.00. Trial bottle free."

### EXCURSION TO OGDEN

And Ogden Canyon.

Sunday, Sept. 2, via Oregon Short Line. Round trip to Ogden only \$1. Trains leave Salt Lake 7:10 and 10:30 a. m., or 1:30, 4:05 or 6:05 p. m. Returning, leave Ogden 4:10 or 6:20 p. m., and special at 10:30 p. m. Fine trout and chicken dinner at the Hermitage in Ogden canyon.

### UTAH COUNTY DIRECTORY.

R. L. Polk & Co. of this city have just issued a very complete Directory of Provo City, in which is included all of the other cities and towns in Utah County, as well as a list of all the Landowners, showing number of acres owned, assessed valuation of same, and owner's postoffice address. This publication is selling for \$3.00 per copy.

### LABOR DAY AT SALT LAKE.

Last day of the season. Thirty trains. Forty-five minute service. Matchless bathing. Good music, fine dancing.

### DIAMOND COAL.

Sold only by Citizen's Coal company, 153 South Main. Phone 49.

Salt Lake Photo Supply Co.

Kodaks & developing. Main & 3d So.

For the best garden hose in town go to George G. Doyle & Co., 211 State street. Reliable plumbers.

# REMOVAL SALE!

Greatest Reduction in Prices on  
Furniture, Carpets, Rugs, Steel  
Ranges, Etc., ever known in this city.

CANE SEAT, SOLID OAK DINING  
CHAIRS, like cut, during Removal Sale at—each

**\$1.00**



Eighty-nine more cheap Steel Ranges will be offered  
at \$30.00 each. They took the highest and first  
award at the St. Louis World's Fair. Every one  
guaranteed. Call in and see them before you buy.

We keep open Saturday's until 10 p.m. to accommodate our  
Customers.

### OUR EASY AND CONVENIENT TERMS:

**\$1.00 on \$10.00; \$10.00 on \$100.**  
NO INTEREST.

**XL FURNITURE & CARPET XL**  
**INSTALLMENT HOUSE XL**

48 E. Second South Street.

Both Phones 490

Salt Lake City, Utah.

**DON'T MISS THIS CHANCE!**

**TOMORROW WILL BE  
THE LAST DAY**

**CLOSING OUT SALE!**

**Japanese Art Auction  
At Saltair.**

To avoid packing of the remaining articles, consisting in part: BRONZE, CLOISSONNE, EMBROIDERED KIMONO, SCREEN, IVORY CARVING, TEAKWOOD CABINET, CHAIR AND STAND, KUTANI CHINA, SATSUMA, ETC. Everything will be sold as rapidly as possible before the season closes

**AT ANY PRICE THAT YOU MAY OFFER.**

NOW IS THE TIME FOR ALL THE SENSIBLE PEOPLE OF SALT LAKE CITY TO COME TO

**Japanese Art Auction Room**

On the Second Floor in Pavilion, Saltair Beach, and Get Something Nice for Your Own Home. A Wedding Present or Birthday Gift, Etc., at YOUR OWN FIGURE.